



**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES  
2<sup>ND</sup> FLOOR, CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
CITY HALL BUILDING, TWO CIVIC CENTER PLAZA  
JUNE 25, 2012  
4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, City Hall Building, June 25, 2012, 4:00 p.m.

The following Commissioners were present:

Commissioner Jim Booher, Chair  
Commissioner Stephanie Fernandez  
Commissioner Joel Guzman  
Commissioner Randy Brock  
Commissioner David Berchelmann  
Commissioner Cesar Gomez

The following City Staff were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Planning, Historic Preservation Officer  
Mr. Tony De La Cruz, Planning, Planner  
Ms. Kristen Hamilton, City Attorney's Office, Assistant City Attorney

Chair Booher called the meeting to order at 4:03½ p.m., quorum present.

**I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT**

*None.*

**CHANGES TO THE AGENDA**

*Ms. Velázquez noted agenda item 2. PHAP12-00013 will be postponed.*

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





## Certificate of Appropriateness

- |                          |  |
|--------------------------|--|
| 1. PHAP12-0012:          | Lots 9 and 10, Block 11, Mundy Heights Addition,<br>City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas |
| Location:                | 1316 Missouri  |
| Historic District:       | Sunset Heights   |
| Property Owner:          | Maria L. Yee and Robert Concha   |
| Representative:          | Gerardo Quinones   |
| Representative District: | #8   |
| Existing Zoning:         | C-2/H (Commercial/Historic)  |
| Year Built:              | N/A  |
| Historic Status:         | N/A  |
| Request:                 | Certificate of appropriateness for the construction<br>of a two story duplex.              |
| Application Filed:       | 5/22/2012  |
| 45 Day Expiration:       | 7/6/2012   |

Ms. Velázquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained the property owners seek approval for the construction of a two story duplex. The request was presented to the commissioners at the June 11<sup>th</sup> meeting. Staff recommended APPROVAL of the request, with modifications. However, due to the letter submitted by the Sunset Heights Neighborhood Improvement Association (SHNIA), who agreed with the design and felt it was appropriate, the commissioners requested staff send their comments/recommendations to SHNIA for review and/or approval. Staff sent those comments/recommendations to SHNIA the very next day; however, as of today, staff has not received any response from SHNIA. Therefore, staff deduces that the neighborhood association has no concerns/issues.

John F. Cook

**City Council**

Ann Morgan Lilly

**Susie Byrd**

Emma Acosta

**Carl L. Robinson**

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

**Eddie Holquin Jr.**

Steve Ortega

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**Joyce A. Wilson**

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





Ms. Velázquez stated the Historic Preservation Office recommends APPROVAL, with modifications\*, of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

*The Magoffin Historic Design Guidelines recommend the following:*

- *Any new construction must be compatible in size, texture, color, design, proportion and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes.*
- *New structures should respect the integrity of existing buildings.*
- *Setbacks, proportion, rhythm, and building elements should all be addressed.*
- *Maintain the predominant existing building line.*
- *All new construction should preserve and enhance the streetscape.*

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:*

- *New construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.*

*\* The modifications are that the parking spaces at the front of the main façade be eliminated and that the new building be constructed in line with the adjacent buildings, the eaves be extended outward up to two feet, and the window surrounds on the main façade will be replaced with sills.*

Commissioner Guzman moved to approve the request. He explained that he had spoken with Ms. Leah Osborne, President, Sunset Heights Neighborhood Improvement Association. Ms. Osborn informed the commissioner that she had not heard any negative comments; furthermore, he felt that what the property owners were trying to accomplish meets the overall guidelines.

Chair Booher asked the commissioners if there was any further discussion relative to this item. There was none.

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Berchelmann*

**AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE PHAP12-0012, AS MODIFIED.**

2. PHAP12-00013:                      South 72 Feet of Lot 20 & South 72 feet of East 8 Feet of Lot 19, Block 14, Mundy Heights Addition, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location:                                1105 W. Main
- Historic District:                      Sunset Heights
- Property Owner:                      Guadalupe Dill
- Representative:                      Guadalupe Dill
- Representative District:            #8
- Existing Zoning:                      C-2/H (Commercial/Historic)
- Year Built:                              1920
- Historic Status:                      Contributing
- Request:                                Certificate of appropriateness to legalize the construction of a deck at the rear yard.
- Application Filed:                    5/30/2012
- 45 Day Expiration:                  7/14/2012

*Item was postponed.*

3. PHAP12-00015:                      Lots 5 & 6, Block 81 Government Hill (3500.00 S), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location:                                4309 Altura Avenue
- Historic District:                      Austin Terrace
- Property Owner:                      Atanacio Arevalo
- Representative:                      Atanacio Arevalo
- Representative District:            #2
- Existing Zoning:                      R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
- Year Built:                              1929
- Historic Status:                      Non-Contributing

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson







Request: Certificate of appropriateness for the installation of a metal canopy in the rear yard after-the-fact.  
Application Filed: 6/12/2012  
45 Day Expiration: 7/27/2012

Ms. Velázquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and stated the property owner seeks approval for the installation of a metal canopy in the rear yard after-the-fact. She noted the canopy cannot be seen from the main façade; however, the canopy is visible as you approach the property from the alleyway. Ms. Velázquez explained staff reviewed the request very carefully, visited the site, and looked at the guidelines. Although the canopy is not visible from the façade, is constructed in the rear, and not attached to the main structure Ms. Velázquez stated staff could not recommend approval of the request. Therefore, the Historic Preservation Office recommends DENIAL of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

*The Magoffin Historic Design Guidelines* recommend the following:

- *Same attention to detail should be taken while planning construction for a secondary structure as was taken for the primary structure.*
- *New additions should be planned so that they are constructed to the rear of the property or on a non-character defining elevation.*
- *Additions should complement the original structure, but not necessarily attempt to duplicate or copy it.*

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* recommend the following:

- *The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion.*

Mr. Atanacio Arevalo, property owner, explained he had the metal canopy installed three years ago when he purchased the home; however, the contractor who installed the canopy did not tell him he needed a permit. He knew the home was located in an historic district but he did not know what the rules were. The reason he is here today is because last month a city

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





inspector gave him a notice and informed him that he had to come to City Hall and get a permit for the canopy.

**COMMENTS/QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF**

Commissioner Guzman asked staff if approving this request would set a precedent.

Ms. Hamilton responded that commissioners approve or deny each request on a case by case basis by reviewing the request and its compatibility with the guidelines and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Commissioner Fernandez explained the property is considered non-contributing because, at the time the historic district was established, the property did not contribute. She clarified that just because something is old does not mean it is historic. Commissioner Fernandez reiterated the property owner did not follow the correct procedure.

Additionally, Mr. De La Cruz stated, the property may have been so greatly modified from its original form that it no longer felt like a contributing designation.

Commissioner Berchelmann asked if there were any viable alternatives.

Chair Booher concurred with Commissioner Fernandez in that the property owner failed to:

1. Request approval of a canopy from the Commission; nor
2. Did he go to Building Permits & Inspections for a permit

Mr. Arevalo stated that he was surprised to receive the notice from the city inspector.

Commissioner Berchelmann commented on home buyers purchasing homes located in a historical district not knowing the historic district policies and procedures when making changes to either the front or rear of their home.

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





Furthermore, there are real estate agents who are not aware of historical district policies and procedures. He felt it was an issue of educating the individuals involved in the transactions of properties within historical districts. Commissioner Berchelmann thought that would make a good topic of discussion for another day.

Commissioner Guzman explained one alternative would be for the commissioners to deny the request and allow Mr. Arevalo to appeal the decision before the City Council.

In his opinion, Chair Booher felt this was a pre-engineered unit and that any additional structure would modify the integrity of the design. He was concerned the canopy would not withstand the wind and upload. Chair Booher referred to the letter from Mr. Ruben Ponce, Jr., P.E., SECB.

Commissioner Brock explained, personally, he would like to approve the request; however, it does not comply with the ordinance.

**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Gomez AND CARRIED TO DENY THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR 4309 ALTURA AVENUE BASED ON THE RECOMMENDATION BY STAFF.*

No further discussion.

**AYES:** Commissioners Fernandez, Guzman, Brock, and Gomez

**NAY:** Commissioner Berchelmann

Motion passed. (4-1)

Following the vote, Mr. De La Cruz explained what options Mr. Arevalo could pursue.

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





4. PHAP12-00016: Trowbridge Drive Right-of-Way, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: Trowbridge Drive between Gateway North Boulevard and Raynolds Street
- Historic District: Austin Terrace
- Property Owner: City of El Paso
- Representative: R. Alan Shubert
- Representative District: #2
- Existing Zoning: R-4/Historic (Residential/Historic)
- Year Built: N/A
- Historic Status: N/A
- Request: Certificate of appropriateness for right-of-way improvements.
- Application Filed: 6/14/2012
- 45 Day Expiration: 7/29/2012

Ms. Velázquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained the applicant seeks approval for right of way improvements along Trowbridge Drive, from Gateway North Boulevard to Raynolds to include selective removal and replacement of existing parkways, medians, street resurfacing, all necessary subterranean improvements, irrigation, installation of trees and plantings, ADA compliant ramps at intersections, installation of brick and masonry paving, and replacement of existing street signs. Ms. Velázquez explained the City of El Paso's Engineering & Construction Management Department submitted the request to provide increased safety in the area due to the high rate of speed on Trowbridge. Some time ago, property owners came to the City requesting assistance in making the area safer. Ms. Velázquez explained the Improvements Plans show:

1. Larger, extended, and ADA accessible curbs;
2. Between Radford and Pennsylvania, not only will the larger curbs be installed, but also trees, landscaping and infill; and
3. The tip of the median will be filled in with brick to serve as an island to allow the individual to stand until traffic passes.

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson







With regard to the installation of new street signs, the Historic Preservation Office staff has requested the City replace the existing street signs with brown street signs that not only name the street but the historic district as well. Ms. Velázquez noted the City has agreed to that request. The Historic Preservation Office recommends APPROVAL of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

*The Magoffin Historic Design Guidelines recommend the following:*

- *Brick and stone pavers are available in a wide assortment of colors and patterns and can contribute to the overall enhancement of an area.*
- *When new landscaping is planned, it should be designed to complement the streetscape.*

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:*

- *Identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.*

**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Berchermann*  
**AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE.**

**Certificate of Appropriateness (Reconsideration)**

5. PHAP11-00022                      Being 33 Franklin Heights 17 To 26 (All Of Blk S Of Alley, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- |                          |                                |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Location:                | 148 Newman                     |
| Historic District:       | Magoffin                       |
| Property Owner:          | Sisters of Perpetual Adoration |
| Representative:          | Alvaro Loya                    |
| Representative District: | 8                              |
| Existing Zoning:         | M1/H                           |
| Year Built:              | c. 1908                        |
| Historic Status:         | Landmark                       |

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson





Request: Reconsideration of a previously approved certificate of appropriateness for a partial demolition and new construction.

Application Filed: June 19, 2012

45 Day Expiration: July 24, 2011

Ms. Velázquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained this request was previously presented to the commissioners at the June 15, 2011 HLC meeting. The original Certificate of Appropriateness was for partial demolition and new construction with some selected demolition in another area of the monastery. However, there have been changes to the plans and the property owner is now proposing a very different footprint from what was originally approved. When a change to a Certificate of Appropriateness is made (a major change requiring submittal of new plans) the request must come back to the Commission for approval. The Historic Preservation Office staff recommendation has not changed due to the bulk of the construction being behind the wall and it would not be very visible; therefore, the Historic Preservation Office recommends APPROVAL of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

*The Magoffin Historic Design Guidelines* recommend the following:

- *New additions should be planned so that they are constructed to the rear of the property or on a non-character defining elevation.*
- *Additions should complement the original structure, but not necessarily attempt to duplicate or copy it.*

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* recommend the following:

- *New additions will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.*
- *The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson





Chair Booher noted the architect was not present in the audience. He asked staff what the elevation was relative to the height of the existing wall.

Per the presentation slide showing the ten foot wall, Ms. Velázquez drew a dotted red line. She stated if she stood next to the wall today, the red line would denote her approximate five foot height.

Commissioner Fernandez wondered why the layout had changed.

Ms. Velázquez responded staff did not know why. She added that this is the first time a change had to be brought back to the commissioners. She noted that if the commissioners want to speak to the architect, the commissioners could postpone the request two weeks.

Commissioner Guzman found it interesting that the property is zoned M-1 (Manufacturing) and it was built in 1908. He expected the structure to be younger; perhaps the original footprint was constructed in 1908.

Ms. Velázquez concurred with Commissioner Guzman that the original footprint was constructed in 1908.

**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Berchelmann, seconded by Commissioner Fernandez*  
**AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE.**

*Chair Booher noted that today was the deadline for HLC members to add properties for the next HLC scheduled HLC meeting.*

6. Addresses of property HLC Commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, Commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. June 25, 2012 deadline for HLC members to request for

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson





agenda items to be scheduled for the July 09, 2012 meeting. July 09, 2012 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the July 23, 2012 meeting.

**A. A. B. Fall Mansion at 1725 Arizona Avenue**

Ms. Velázquez noted there were no photos to present to the commissioners; however, every week, when she meets with Engineering staff, she is told the project is in the final stages and that the Department is just waiting for the contractor to finish up. Due to the scope of the project, the project is as close to completing in a timely manner as possible.

Chair Booher wondered if Ms. Velázquez knew who the proposed tenant would be.

Ms. Velázquez responded no, she did not have that information.

**HLC Staff Report**

7. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda.  
(See Attachment "A")

Chair Booher asked if the commissioners had any comments and/or questions. There were none.

***MOTION:***

*Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW STATUS REPORT.*

**Planning & Economic Development Department Reports**

8. None.

**Visionaries in Preservation Report**

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson







9. None.

**Other Business**

10. A. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for June 11, 2012.

Chair Booher asked if the commissioners had any comments and/or questions.

**PAGE 8 OF 24**

Commissioner Berchelmann requested staff revise the following from:

**FOR THE RECORD**

~~Commissioner Berchelmann requested, for the record, that the property owner did express concern that there was not a copy of the survey showing the property lines.~~

For the record, Commissioner Berchelmann expressed his concerns that there was not a copy of the survey showing the property lines.

**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Berchelmann, seconded by Commissioner Guzman*  
**AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES FOR JUNE 11, 2012, AS REVISED PER COMMISSIONER BERCHELMANN.**

**ABSTAIN:** *Commissioner Brock*

B. Election of a Vice-Chairman.

Commissioner Guzman nominated Commissioner Berchelmann as Vice-Chairman. He felt Commissioner Berchelmann conducted the May 21<sup>st</sup> HLC meeting professionally and in a timely manner. Additionally, he complimented Commissioner Berchelmann on his knowledge of Robert's Rules of Order.

Ms. Velázquez added the meeting set a new record time of 23 minutes.

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson





Chair Booher noted Commissioner Berchermann's timeliness is duly noted.

**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ELECT COMMISSIONER BERCHELMANN AS THE VICE-CHAIRMAN OF THE HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION.*

- C. Discussion and action regarding memorandum changing Chapter 20.20 (Historic Landmark Preservation) so that non-contributing properties in the Downtown Historic District will require a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Ms. Velázquez stated not everyone will have the same opinions as commissioners and staff regarding properties located within the Downtown Historic District that all properties should come under the same review. She explained that a suggestion was made whereby rather than changing the design guidelines so that non-contributing properties have to comply, perhaps staff could review the non-contributing properties to determine whether or not they are in fact contributing. Staff thought that that would be a fairly easy process; however, it turned out to be otherwise. This suggestion included rezoning the properties, at a significant cost.

Commissioner Guzman thought there were six or seven non-contributing properties located within the Downtown Historic District.

Ms. Velázquez responded that there are more than that; additionally, she was surprised to see the Buckler and the American Furniture Buildings on the list. She made remarks regarding the 1948 changes to the façade of the American Furniture Building and how changes can acquire significance in their own right.

Vice-Chair Berchermann asked staff what the cost and process is to rezone.

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





Mr. De La Cruz responded that would depend on the individual properties. He elaborated on the process and cost for a rezoning and detailed site plan development application. Because the City does not have an on-staff surveyor, the 1.2 acre survey for the H-Overlay rezoning of Houston Elementary School cost between \$5,000 and \$6,000.

Vice-Chairman Berchermann asked if staff could prepare a PowerPoint presentation on the non-contributing properties.

Ms. Velázquez responded staff could have that available for the July 9<sup>th</sup> HLC meeting.

Commissioner Gomez asked staff if each non-contributing property could be rezoned on a case by case basis.

Mr. De La Cruz responded yes and clarified it would be changing of status of individual buildings within the district, not necessarily upgrading all existing buildings from their current designation. However, as it would be considered a change of status, the property would have to go through the entire application process.

*Vice-Chair Berchermann asked if staff knew which of those non-contributing properties that may be redeveloped in the future.*

*Mr. De La Cruz responded yes; however, the item would have to be placed on the agenda for discussion.*

Commissioner Fernandez asked staff if those non-contributing property owners were in favor of the changes.

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





Ms. Velázquez responded the message is that they are not receptive to the changes. She noted that the changes clarify what does and does not need to come before the Commission. For example, a non-contributing property owner may change out the windows without having to come before the commission.

Mr. De La Cruz reiterated demolition is addressed in Title 20 of the Municipal Code, not the guidelines. Furthermore, regardless of historic district or designation, a Certificate of Demolition must come before this commission.

**GUIDELINES AND THE CODE:**

Staff and commissioners discussed:

1. Non-contributing properties, with H-Overlays, do not have to follow the guidelines; and
2. Non-contributing properties, with H-Overlays, do not have to follow the guidelines but require a Certificate of Appropriateness.

*Mr. De La Cruz clarified the ordinance language clearly states that the property owner does not have to abide by the guidelines; however, it does not state that they do not have to receive a Certificate of Appropriateness. The conundrum there is what does this commission review it under, if there are no guidelines to hold them to. Additionally, other city boards and commissions have written formal letters to City Council recommending that these ordinances be modified. He explained that, per the Planning Director, this would be the most influential approach to take.*

Chair Booher asked staff to prepare a PowerPoint presentation on the Downtown Historic District non-contributing structures and their condition and place that item on the next HLC meeting agenda.

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027







Ms. Velázquez noted that a definition of *non-contributing* was in the ordinance. She also expounded on the creation of historic districts and possibly how non-contributing and contributing properties are classified. Ms. Velázquez referred to the alteration of the Mills Building; however, the structure is now listed on the National Register. Reversing a property from non-contributing to contributing status is very possible.

Commissioners and staff made comments regarding the creation of the Downtown Historic District and the designation of contributing and non-contributing structures 20 years ago. Staff noted that the HLC's outlook, at that time, was different; furthermore, they did not have access to the research and technology that exists today.

Commissioner Guzman noted that there are three Trost & Trost buildings designated as non-contributing in the Downtown Historic District map.

Ms. Velázquez noted that she has always said *what was non-contributing then could very well be contributing tomorrow*. Furthermore, non-contributing properties are not eligible for the historic tax exemption.

Mr. De La Cruz reiterated staff will prepare the PowerPoint presentation to include historic photos of the buildings and original drawings of the Trost buildings. Staff will demonstrate the structure as it was built and as it exists now.

Chair Booher asked staff to place the PowerPoint presentation on the next HLC meeting agenda.

- D. Discussion regarding scheduling of the Historic Landmark Commissioners drive through El Paso's historic districts.

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





Ms. Velázquez referred to the Austin Terrace Historic District and why certain properties were included within that district. She researched the situation and discovered that it was the property owners who requested that their properties be in the district, *even though their properties did not fall in with or resemble the other properties and to protect the properties from any encroachments.*

Ms. Velázquez suggested removing the item from the agenda and, perhaps in the fall, scheduling a walk through El Paso's historic districts.

Per the Open Meetings Act, Ms. Hamilton explained space must be made available for members of the public to attend the event and that an agenda must be posted to avoid any quorum issues.

**E. Discussion of Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts.**

Ms. Velázquez asked commissioners if they had read the guidelines included in their agenda packets at the prior meeting.

Chair Booher requested staff defer the item to the next meeting agenda.

Ms. Velázquez stated that the commissioners' comments and/or suggestions must be received prior to the next HLC meeting.

Commissioner Gomez asked if staff had received any comments from the different Districts.

Mr. De La Cruz responded staff met with Sunset Heights, Manhattan Heights and had a meeting tomorrow with a representative from Austin Terrace. Staff has received some good input which we will bring to the commissioners for review. He noted that, in the more active districts, they have provided input regarding what they would like to see in their district. Unfortunately, a request was made whereby each historic district would have their individual guidelines. Staff and more importantly, the

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





Department Director, do not see that being a true alternative for districts that are so similar in style. Staff will forward the comments from those neighborhood associations so that you will be aware of what will be discussed.

Chair Booher responded receiving that information, prior to the next meeting, would be helpful.

Commissioner Guzman wondered if it would be possible to note the names of each historic district in the Guidelines; for example:

*Sunset Heights/Manhattan Heights/Austin Terrace/etc. Design Guidelines*

He explained, although all districts will be inclusive within the design guidelines, each district will be named individually. He also requested that a small historical narrative be included.

Mr. De La Cruz responded there is a small narrative for each district and it is specific to the historic districts that currently lack guidelines. Districts with existing guidelines will retain their individual guidelines.

For homework, Ms. Velázquez noted that staff will:

1. Email the design guidelines;
2. Email the comments from the neighborhood associations

**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Fernandez*  
**AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE HISTORIC**  
**LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING AT 5:04 P.M.**

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson

Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

